

CERTIFIED LOCAL GOVERNMENT ANNUAL REPORT

OCTOBER 2010 – SEPTEMBER 2011

TWO SECTIONS Webster-Kirkwood
TIMES
Your Hometown Newspaper Since 1978

**Kirkwood
Pioneers
Turn Out To
Support
Mike Bales**
see page 1B

Nov. 4 - 10, 2011 **LOCALLY OWNED & OPERATED** Vol. 34, No. 18

Rescue Fails; Brownhurst Demolished



Kirkwood Landmarks Commission unable to save 119-year-old residence located on Vianney campus

by Jaime Mowers

Kirkwood's Brownhurst building is no more. Demolition crews descended on the property Tuesday, Nov. 1, and began razing the 119-year-old structure.

The city of Kirkwood issued the demolition permit to the Society of Mary or Marianists, who own the building that sits on the St. John Vianney High School campus. The permit was issued on Oct. 26 and Aalco Wrecking started demolition on Nov. 1.

The fate of Brownhurst – which some called a historic treasure and others deemed a dangerous eyesore – has been in limbo for months while Kirkwood's Historic Landmarks Commission tried to keep the Marianists from tearing it down.

The Marianists have long wanted Brownhurst gone, saying the deteriorating building posed safety threats to Vianney students and visitors. The society was willing

cont. p. 8A

A crew from Aalco Wrecking uses heavy equipment to take down Brownhurst. The building, owned by the Marianists and located on the St. John Vianney campus, was demolished on Tuesday, Nov. 1.

photo by Diana Linsley

For submission to
Missouri Department of Natural Resources
STATE HISTORIC PRESERVATION OFFICE
P.O. Box 176
Jefferson City, MO 65102

TABLE OF CONTENTS

PART I: DUTIES AND RESPONSIBILITIES2

PART II: THE COMMISSION3

PART III: SCHEDULE OF MEETINGS HELD AND ATTENDANCE3

PART IV: EDUCATIONAL SEMINARS AND/OR CONFERENCES ATTENDED4

PART V: HISTORIC PROPERTY INVENTORY SYSTEM, MAINTENANCE & UPDATE....4

PART VI: LOCAL LANDMARKS AND/OR DISTRICTS NOMINATED4

PART VII: LOCAL LANDMARKS AND/OR NATIONAL REGISTER OF PLACES AND
DISTRICTS DESIGNATED8

PART VIII: NATIONAL REGISTER OF HISTORIC PLACES NOMINATIONS8

PART IX (A): CASES OF REVIEW FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS9

PART IX (B): OTHER CASE DECISIONS 10

PART X: PUBLIC OUTREACH AND EDUCATIONAL EFFORTS 10

PART XI: PRESERVATION PLANS, CHANGES OR REVISIONS 19

CERTIFIED LOCAL GOVERNMENT ANNUAL REPORT 2010-2011

CITY OF KIRKWOOD LANDMARKS COMMISSION

PART I: DUTIES AND RESPONSIBILITIES

**WHERE
HAVE
WE BEEN**

The Kirkwood Landmarks Commission was originally established in 1981 by Ordinance No. 6697 to identify and designate landmarks within the City of Kirkwood. In 1986, the City repealed the original ordinance and replaced it with Ordinance No. 7534 that increased the scope of the Commission’s work to “study, identify and designate landmarks and historic districts within the City; to review proposed changes in landmarks and to make recommendations to encourage the preservation of such landmarks or historic districts.” In July 1986 the City of Kirkwood became a Certified Local Government, with the benefits afforded to it by the State Historic Preservation Office.

The Office of the Landmarks Commission is located in Kirkwood City Hall, staffed by a city employee, Alan Lamberg, a 36 CFR Part 61-qualified historian with seven years’ experience in historic preservation, with a Master’s degree in Public Administration, which encompasses public policy and urban planning. Further support originates from Chief Administrative Officers, Management Information Systems, and the Office of the Building Commissioner.

**WHERE
WE
ARE GOING**

This year was marked by several losses of neglected historic places in Kirkwood. The cultural heritage of Kirkwood provides for its unique character today and tomorrow. Will this community accept liquidation of their cultural heritage?

Developers and preservationists should not surrender to their divisions during uncertain economic times. They should not speculate on the future while historic places are neglected and weathered by time. They should engage and negotiate balanced solutions that do right for themselves and their community. It is true that resources, money and time are increasingly scarce, which is why sustainable solutions such as adaptive reuse can work. Imagine what can be accomplished when a community is proactively engaged in long range planning among diverse stakeholders.

Historic preservation requires more than dedication from a commission, property owners and community leaders. It requires a cohesive vision from stakeholders and all citizens who live for the common good. The mission must inspire the citizenry through outreach and education, and it must invite direct action by community groups, societies, clubs, congregations, and businesses. A community can protect, retain, enhance *and capitalize* on their cultural heritage.

The Kirkwood Landmarks Commission recognizes and preserves properties that represent or reflect elements of the City's thriving cultural heritage and architectural history. Certified by the State of Missouri's Historic Preservation Office, the mission of the Landmarks Commission is to protect, retain, and enhance such properties. All properties designated local landmarks and all properties within local historic districts are afforded the same rights and protection, with the greater goal of sustaining neighborhood historic integrity and property values.

Policy Statement, 2010

PART II: THE COMMISSION

The Commission is composed of seven citizens of Kirkwood, chosen to serve on the Commission because of “demonstrated interest in, competence in, or knowledge of historic preservation.” Each member serves for a three-year term and can be reappointed for one additional term. Appointments are considered in the month of June. *See enclosed Volunteer Profiles and Résumés.* Council Member Paul Ward is Council Liaison. Commission members and their expiration of terms are outlined on the next page.

MEMBER	APPOINTED	TERM	STATUS	RELATED FIELD
Tom Riggs	2005	2011	concluded	Construction
Lisa Hautly	2009	2012	resigned	Landmark Owner / Marketing
Dave Brown	2006	2012	in service	Realtor
Matthew Bivens	2007	2012	in service	Preservation Specialist
Catherine Enslin	2009	2012	in service	Architect
Darryl Labruyere	2010	2013	in service	Architect
Judith Franklin Ward	2010	2013	in service	Designer
Mike Lewis	2011	2014	appointed	Construction

NEW MEMBERS AND OFFICERS:

Tom Riggs concluded two full terms on the Commission in June 2011. Lisa Hautly resigned within one term. One new member, Mike Lewis, was appointed. Elected officers are Dave Brown, Chair; Catherine Enslin, Vice-Chair; with a vacancy for Recording Secretary.

In the Subcommittee for Development of Design Guidelines, Catherine Enslin is Chair, and Darryl Labruyere is Vice-Chair. David Meyers is ex officio.

PART III: SCHEDULE OF MEETINGS HELD AND ATTENDANCE

The Commission holds regularly scheduled meetings on the second Wednesday of each month. During this report period, the Commission held (17) meetings; eleven (12) regular, five (5) special, and no joint design review with the Kirkwood Architectural Review Board. For each meeting the individual attendance records are shown below:

2010– 2011

	Oct 13 th	Oct 22 th	Nov 10 th	Dec 3 rd	Dec 8 th	Jan 7 th	Jan 12 th	Feb 9 th	Feb 16 th	Mar 9 th	Apr 14 th	May 11 th	Jun 8 th	Jul 8 th	Jul 13 th	Aug 10 th	Sep 11 th
SPECIAL MTG →	SUB		SUB		SUB			SUB			SUB						
Matt Bivens	x		x							x			x				x
Dave Brown	x		x		x			x		x			x				x
Catherine Enslin	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x
Lisa Hautly	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	na	na	na	na	na
David Meyers	na	x	na	x	na	x	na	na	x	na	na	na	na	x	na	na	na
Darryl Labruyere	x	x			x	x	x	x	x		x	x	x	x	x	x	x
Mike Lewis	na	na	na	na	na	na	na	na	na	na	na	na	x		x	x	x
Tom Riggs	x		x		x			x		x			x	na	na	na	na
Judith Franklin Ward	x		x		x			x					x		x	x	x
Paul Ward	x						x	x			x		x				x
Alan Lamberg	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x	x

x = present na = not applicable SUB = subcommittee ARB = Architectural Review Board, Joint Design Review

PART IV: EDUCATIONAL SEMINARS AND/OR CONFERENCES ATTENDED

No report on commissioners and/or staff training this year.

PART V: HISTORIC PROPERTY INVENTORY SYSTEM, MAINTENANCE & UPDATE

A procedure was devised for scoring properties for inclusion in historic districts based on criteria for determination. See section on “Nomination” North Taylor for details.

(2011 FEB) St. Louis County Preservation Historian Esley Hamilton worked with his students from Washington University to survey the architecture of Craig Woods subdivision. The historic inventory product was advanced yet concise. Architectural features were illustrated in an array of standard sketches. The historic inventory was posted to the city website by the Public Commissions Officer, Beth von Behren.

PART VI: LOCAL LANDMARKS AND/OR DISTRICTS NOMINATED

Continuation of proposed local historic district of North Taylor (2010 OCT). *For background, see 2009-2010 Annual Report, page 3.*

Staff report on field survey; owner consent. Mr. Lamberg reported that the field survey was a success, where eight teams updated historic inventory for 179 homes on October 2. In-kind volunteer time is over 200 hours. The historic inventory indicates 130 homes are contributing resources to a historic district. In writing, 99 owners consented, and 15 owners dissented.

Criteria for designation; map with proposed areas for inclusion. Mr. Lamberg wrote criteria for determination of a local historic district. It utilizes established criteria from the National Parks Service, and another set of criteria based on reasonable considerations pertinent to local impacts, including local landmark status, owner consent or dissent, contributing status, and other exceptional considerations, such as intention of owner to demolish and infill, and zoning status. Criteria are available upon request. Mr. Lamberg scored each home according to the criteria, and presented a map that showed the viability for inclusion into a historic district. One map utilized a statistical method based on the standard deviation of the total number of homes and the distribution of scores. Another map showed a more conservative deviation.

Public comment was recorded by seven guests present at the meeting (*see minutes and audio*).

Determination by Commission. The lowest scoring homes were closely observed. Comr. Hautly stated that all of the homes in the surveyed area would be served by design review for new construction, including the homes in poor condition or that are on the verge of demolition. Comr. Riggs stated that lowest scoring properties would be a reasonable basis for letting stay of demolition lapse at the minimum of 60 days. Effort was made to look at every property on the edges of the district, including the extra homes surveyed on Jewel and Swan. Comr. Ward motioned to include into the North Taylor local historic district all surveyed and scored homes as indicated on the map; Comr. Brown seconded; unanimously approved.

Proposed local historic district of Craig Woods

Owner Initiative

- (2011 MAR) Comr. Ward is liaison with the Wash U architectural study group on the presentation of their findings, which will be held April 15 at Wash U. Craig Woods resident, Nancy Luetzow came to this meeting and spoke at length about her concern for keeping the original architectural integrity of the neighborhood. Nancy Luetzow of Craig Woods Subdivision requested information on national and local historic districts and design guidelines. After discussion with various commissioners, Mr. Lamberg offered to e-mail information, including accolades from various Kirkwood citizens regarding historic districts and interaction with the commission. This information was shared with neighbors as they continued to discuss the pros and cons of Craig Woods becoming a historic district.
- (2011 MAY) Several inquiries from subdivision residents seeking guidance on preservation of the neighborhood. Mr. Lamberg relayed report from Comr. Ward, who is engaged in outreach with members of the trustees and preservation historian, Esley Hamilton.
- (2011 JUN) Comr. Ward reported that volunteers are preparing a petition for Local Historic District status. Neighborhood property owner Kathy Dunlap expressed thanks to Esley Hamilton and his students for a comprehensive survey of the neighborhood including full color photos and narrative of the entire neighborhood.
- (2011 JUL) Comr. Ward presented a petition from homeowners in Craig Woods with significant support of nominating their subdivision as a local historic district. City staff begins procedures and public hearing regarding this nomination.
- (2011 AUG) Mr. Lamberg sent letters to owners and notification of a public hearing to be held on September 14.

Public Hearing (2011 SEP)

- **Staff presentation to provide background and findings of fact:** Mr. Lamberg presented a slideshow providing a shortcut link¹ to the city's website on historic preservation; background on the Landmarks Commission and its activities since the 1980s; invite the public to read "Historic Resources of Kirkwood";² explanation of historic districts; Craig Woods initiative by property owners; staff outreach to owners; proposal, including objectives for designation; rules & regulations; availability of historic inventory & design guidelines; exceptional architectural survey by Mr. Esley Hamilton and his students from Washington University.

¹ <http://goo.gl/a50As>

² <http://www.dnr.mo.gov/shpo/nps-nr/64500812.pdf>

- **Petitioner Statement:** Nancy Luetzow and Kathe Dunlop spoke on behalf of petitioners, including Dave Haring & Larry Sherwin. Stated that Carolyn Toft, former executive director of St. Louis Landmarks Association, was positively impressed by Craig Woods and asked Esley Hamilton to conduct an architectural survey. The petitioners shared background on their initiative, dating back to 2005 in response to demolitions. They are also working to update covenants and bylaws. They commended Comr. Ward for her assistance and advocacy. She, in turn, commended Esley Hamilton and his students for their work.
- **Public Comment:**
 - David Forrest of 1224 DuBois Ct is a homebuilder who worked with Craig Woods architect Ralph Fournier, and is concerned about homes that are not maintained or updated. He did not sign petition because he is concerned about architectural limitations during design review. He agrees that Craig Woods homes ought to be rebuilt in compatible style and look, just not recreate history with the exact same materials. Noted that builder Burton Duenke should be credited with the characteristic Craig Woods style.
 - Joe Day of 654 Craigwoods Dr stated support for historic district status, and that he believes owners in Craigwoods West would be interested in being part of a district.
 - Elizabeth Harding of 1214 Craigvale Ct stated that she did not sign the petition because she believes a significant number of houses in Craig Woods are not desirable, and will eventually be replaced with bigger homes. She cited examples of homes in the neighborhood that have been altered and have lost historic features. She questioned if non-contributing homes would adversely affect historic district status.
 - Comr. Ward stated that non-contributing homes can be present in historic districts, and Comr. Bivens clarified that is because there is more than 50% contributing homes.
 - Nancy Luetzow of 1208 DuBois reported that trustees are working to update the covenants regarding exterior architectural considerations.
 - Staff & Comr. Lewis reported facts on new residential design guidelines and review by the Architectural Review Board, which apply to all residences in Kirkwood.
 - Comr. Brown stated that owners in the neighborhood will make the changes they wish to see. The worst case scenario is waiting 270 days for demolition.
- **Commission discussion:** Mr. Lamberg will mail a second round of letters to owners, inviting further feedback. He also encouraged everyone to look at the Design Guidelines for Landmarks & Historic Districts. Comr. Brown instructed staff to consult with Comr. Lewis on builder's concerns, and how citizens can best educate themselves on design guidelines and regulations.

Continuance of Public Hearing (2011 OCT)

- **Staff report of new findings of fact**, followed by **Public Comment**. Esley Hamilton of St Louis County Parks; Craig Woods home owners – Kevin Lowder; Kathy Oughton; Bill Curson; Nancy Luetzow; David Haring.
- **Discussions:** Whether Historic District will encourage maintenance of properties, concern about the wait of stay of demolition, outdated covenants, trustees need to study and legally decide what needs to be done, advantage of plan review and infill control.
- **Commission discussion:** Architectural Review Board regulations have a 180-day waiting period. Any infill that meets infill code is approved after 180 days. Landmarks Commission requires infill design review for local historic district. Designs are either approved, approved with conditions, or denied (with option to appeal to City Council.)

Continuance of Public Hearing (2011 NOV)

- **Staff report of new findings of fact:** Mr. Lamberg discussed and clarified with citizens present the procedures for demolition review and design review, and how the Architectural Review Board can be advised by the Landmarks Commission. Mr. Lamberg cited the current consensus, in writing, at 53% affirmative, 28% disagree, and 18% abstain.
- **Public Comment:** Ms. Deanna Kiel asked for clarification on how buyers would obtain disclosure from sellers about the house being in a local historic district. Mr. Lamberg explained that all landmarks and local historic districts are registered with the St. Louis County recorder of deeds, so it is at least disclosed in the title search. Furthermore, the Building Commission Office reminds owners when they seek occupancy permits, etc.
- **Commission Discussion:** Seeing no further discussion from citizens, Comr. Ward motioned to designate Craig Woods as a local historic district; seconded by Bivens; unanimously approved.

**PART VII: LOCAL LANDMARKS AND/OR NATIONAL REGISTER OF PLACES
AND DISTRICTS DESIGNATED**

North Taylor is the fourth Local Historic District in Kirkwood (2010 OCT)

Legal Description from Designation Declaration, submitted to St. Louis County Recorder of Deeds (2011 MAR)

ALL PROPERTIES ADDRESSED IN KIRKWOOD ON NORTH TAYLOR AVENUE IN THE RANGES OF 216 TO 324 AND 400 TO 1049; AND ON 202 TO 218 EAST ADAMS AVENUE; AND ON 212 TO 219 EAST WASHINGTON AVENUE; AND ON 214 TO 220 ORRICK LANE; AND ON 130, 208, 215 & 221 EAST BODLEY AVENUE; AND ON 123, 133 & 145 EAST ESSEX AVENUE; AND ON 1 TO 4 CHURCHILL LANE; AND ON 620 TO 625 ERICSON PLACE; AND ON 219 TO 243 LONGVIEW BOULEVARD; AND ON 125 TO 130 EAST JEWEL AVENUE; AND ON 1 TO 10 TAYLOR ESTATES STREET; AND ON 1 TO 25 TAYLOR WOODS DRIVE; AND ON 112 TO 130 SWAN AVENUE; AND ON 1 & 8 SUNSET LANE; AND ON 204 EAST SARAH AVENUE; AND ON 144 & 145 EAST MAPLE AVENUE.

Craig Woods is the fifth Local Historic District in Kirkwood (2011 NOV)

Legal Description from Designation Declaration, submitted to St. Louis County Recorder of Deeds (2011 DEC)

ALL PROPERTIES ADDRESSED IN KIRKWOOD ON 1111 CRAIG DRIVE; 628 TO 739 CRAIGWOODS DRIVE; AND ON 1202 TO 1235 CRAIGVALE COURT; AND ON 1203 TO 1233 DUBRAY COURT; AND ON 1204 TO 1230 DUBOIS COURT.

PART VIII: NATIONAL REGISTER OF HISTORIC PLACES NOMINATIONS

North Taylor Historic District. *For background, see 2009-2010 Annual Report, page 4.*

(2011 JAN) The application to the National Parks Service for grant of \$9,000 to hire a preservation specialist to write a nomination was approved by the State Historic Preservation Office. Staff will begin working with SHPO on outlining an agreement. Comr. Bivens will finalize the Request for Qualifications before sending it to the city's purchasing department.

(2011 JUN) A consultant has been selected from a request for proposal process. Landmarks Association of St. Louis, Inc. will work together with Landmarks Commission to prepare the Nomination for North Taylor Historic District. This will be on the council agenda for June 16th for a resolution of support.

(2011 AUG) Introduction of consultants to residents present at the meeting. Andrew Weil and Ryan Reed of Landmarks Association of St. Louis explain their method for writing a nomination, which emphasizes grassroots participation. They can help generate ideas that have lasting positive effects on historic preservation that are meaningful to the community.

(2011 SEP) Mr. Lamberg reported delivery of North Taylor historic inventory, research and photographs, and base maps to the consultants.

For further information, see 2011-2012 Annual Report.

PART IX (A): CASES OF REVIEW FOR CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS

Three (3) Certificates of Appropriateness (CoA) were issued (affecting single-family residences in historic districts of Jefferson-Argonne, North Taylor, and Meramec Highlands. One (1) case was withdrawn and void. Three (3) reviews of permits for demolition for one (1) landmark building and two (2) single-family residences in Jefferson-Argonne historic district.

Listed below are the cases reviewed. *See enclosed, "Summaries of cases."*

#10-09. 403 East Jefferson Avenue, (Jefferson-Argonne Local Historic District). Thomas Kelly, owner, for application of demolition permit. During the public hearing, a 4-3 decision let the stay of demolition lapse at the minimum of 60 days from date of application.

#10-10. 403 East Jefferson Avenue, (Jefferson-Argonne Local Historic District). Thomas Kelly, property owner. New construction of a single-family residence. Approved as-is, with an aesthetic suggestion. At a subsequent meeting, Mr. Kelly returned with revised plans. Approved with conditions. Six months later, Comr. Hautly observed that the owner has listed the yet-to-be-built property on the real estate market.

#10-11. 977 North Taylor Avenue, (North Taylor Local Historic District). Chris Unland on behalf of property owner, Doreen Rey. New construction of a single-family residence. Approved as-is, with an aesthetic suggestion. Comr. Enslin later observed that certain features of the plans were not built according to the building plans.

#11-01. 109 Dickson Street, (Jefferson-Argonne Local Historic District). Comr. Tom Riggs on behalf of property owner. The applicant withdrew the application, since modifications are not required for review of non-landmarks in this historic district.

#11-02. 1051 Barberry Lane, (Meramec Highlands Local Historic District). Kevin O'Brien, builder and property owner. New construction of a single-family residence. Approved as-is, with aesthetic suggestions.

#11-03. 1201 South Kirkwood Road, (Landmark #79, Brownhurst). Aalco Wrecking Company, on behalf of St. John Vianney High School, Chaminade College, Society of Mary Province of St. Louis, for application of demolition permit. During the first public hearing in July, the commission decided to extend the stay of demolition until the next meeting. They had to resolve a legal question of whether or not the Landmarks Commission is liable for public safety when extending stay of demolition of a condemned building. (The Building Commissioner later issued a notice to the owners to secure the building and the surrounding site.) At the following public hearing in August, after deliberation and discussion, the commission extended the stay of demolition for no more than 30 days. This enabled Comr. Bivens to implement an action plan that included outreach for preservation alternative and documentation of the historic building. While the demolition permit was available by September, the commission **and** stakeholders, including Comr. Mike Lewis and former Comr. Kim Spurgeon, endeavored to complete the documentation. Unfortunately,

negotiations did not proceed between a philanthropist and the Marianists. The building was demolished in November.

#11-04. 106 North Fillmore Avenue, (Jefferson-Argonne Local Historic District). Beth and John Morris, owners, for application of demolition permit. During the public hearing, the commission considered the findings of fact. They did not extend the stay of demolition beyond the minimum of 60 days from date of application.

PART IX (B): OTHER CASE DECISIONS

None.

PART X: PUBLIC OUTREACH AND EDUCATIONAL EFFORTS

LOCAL LANDMARKS

Mudd's Grove (Landmark #03) at 302 West Argonne Avenue. (2010 OCT) Former Comr. Tom Riggs volunteered his service as a liaison on behalf of the Kirkwood Historical Society (KHS), headquartered at Mudd's Grove. He utilized his contractor expertise to advise the KHS board and the community-at-large about repairs of the landmark.

Gill Home (Landmark #07) at 419 E Argonne. (2010 OCT) Mr. Best, co-owner, contacted the Office inquiring how the tax credits for historic preservation work. Mr. Lamberg printed information for Mr. Best to pick up. (2011 MAR) Discussion between members of the commission yielded consensus opinion; that the owners ought to sell the house to a buyer who will use the tax credits to restore and occupy it.

(2011 AUG) Comr. Ward asked how the commission can be proactive so that what is happening with Brownhurst doesn't happen with the Gill House. Many of the members of the commission have outreached to the homeowners in recent years, and recognize that in these cases the owners need to ask for substantial help from the community-at-large before the property deteriorates beyond repair. Building Code Enforcement should be utilized as a last resort in cases where owners do not respond to proactive outreach

Warner House (Landmark #27) at 750 North Taylor Avenue. (2010 OCT): Commission clarified to owner that new construction is subject to plan review by the Planning & Zoning Commission, and, if designated a local historic district before permit is submitted, design review by the Landmarks Commission. (2011 JAN): Maximum stay of demolition (270 days) lapsed with no preservation-minded buyers making a better offer to the seller. (2011 MAR) John Pitcher submitted to the Building Commissioner a Community Unit Plan of four (4) homes. Zoning Administrator Jeremy Knapp advised Mr. Pitcher that the plan did not comply with Zoning Code and Subdivision Code requirements, and would require certain waivers from the Planning & Zoning Commission. (2011 JUN): Planning & Zoning Commission had public hearing for proposed development. (2011 AUG): Planning & Zoning Commission subcommittee, chaired by Tad Skelton, recommended to not approve the Community Unit Plan. (2011 SEP): Mr. Pitcher submitted a revised Community Unit Plan with three (3) houses. (2011 NOV): Planning & Zoning Commission subcommittee

recommended denial of plans. Their determination was based on the petitioner not sufficiently proving a hardship to justify waivers.

For further information, see 2011-2012 Annual Report.

Old Post Office (Landmark #54) at 125 Argonne Drive. (2010 OCT) Comr. Riggs reported attendance to Planning & Zoning meeting where Great Harvest Bread, lessor, petitioned for a special use permit. At a later date, Mr. Lamberg advised their representative, Mr. Walsh, on what modifications to the building are subject to design review, and encouraged use of historic tax credits since Downtown Kirkwood is listed on the National Register.

Couch-Heinzelmann Stores (Landmark #73 & #74) a 157 W Argonne; 102 N Clay. (2010 OCT) Featured on a KSDK news story "Show Me St. Louis Great Escapes." The report included Mr. Lamberg's interview explaining how Downtown was listed on the National Register.

Nipher House (Landmark #82) at 435 N Harrison. (2010 OCT) A potential buyer obtained historic inventory and tax credit information for this house that is individually listed on the National Register. The buyer is looking into residential LEED certification, too.

HISTORIC DISTRICTS

Local historic district of North Taylor

814 N Taylor & outbuilding. (2011 FEB): Comr. Brown noted that the property has been listed in the MLS and that the Realtor represents the Estate. Historian Sue Burkett and the Kirkwood Historical Society provided historical facts not in the present inventory. Notably, the outbuilding was part of the property next door at 810 N Taylor.

Research about this historic district is being compiled as part of the National Register nomination.

National historic district of East Monroe

223 Smith Ave. (2011 MAR) possible demolition. No news and no plans submitted to our knowledge.

Local historic district of Meramec Highlands

(2011 MAR): Pending development of lots on former site of hotel on Ponca Trail. Owner has cleared land on and off over the years since acquiring the property but has not yet submitted plans for redevelopment which will have to come before LC. (2011 APR): Board of Adjustment received a petition to request certain variances for development of the former hotel site. Comr. Hautly asked Mr. Lamberg to provide a copy of design guidelines to the Board of Adjustment before their meeting. (2011 JUN): 44 Ponca Trail: Subject to ongoing legal action between its property owners and certain trustees, regarding use of common grounds.

National historic district of Downtown Kirkwood

Mel Bay building at 107, 109 & 113 W Jefferson Ave. (2011 OCT): Parking lot proposal being considered by City Council, Landmarks Commission directed staff to draft resolution advising against this plan and to demolish historic buildings, and to seek alternative long term solution to parking. (2011 NOV): Mayor McDonnell stated that the council continued the bill until December so that the next phase will review environmental impact on site.

Local historic district of Savoy

(2011 NOV) Comr. Enslin asked Mr. Lamberg for contact of Savoy homeowners who can advise on architectural style.

SUPPORTING PROCEDURAL DUE PROCESS

Design Guidelines for Kirkwood Landmarks & Historic Districts

- (2010 OCT) Subcommittee meeting. Comr. Enslin reported work on new construction guidelines. Confer with ARB infill guidelines. Create overall city guidelines for Historic Districts with a historic overview for each district. Other cities were reviewed and found to have such guidelines.
- (2010 DEC) Subcommittee meeting. Comr. Hautly reported that significant progress has been made with the hope for a January Public Hearing. Comr. Enslin walked Commissioners through a draft of design guidelines and will follow up with Staff Liaison Lamberg on corrections that need to be made. It was noted by Commissioners that a considerable amount of time and effort has been contributed to this endeavor by Comr. Enslin.
- (2011 JAN):
 - **Corrections and adjustments to formatting** received from Comr. Enslin, and standards for maintenance & rehabilitation consolidated.
 - **Sections pending development:** (1) site work by Meyers; (2) mechanical equipment by Meyers; (3) alteration of non-historic buildings in historic districts; (4) temporary stay of demolition by Lamberg; (5) Intent of design guidelines by Hautly, as edited by Enslin, referring to Naperville; (6) tax credit process by Bivens; (7) outreach by Ward.
 - **Architectural styles and their descriptive features** to be completed by architects Enslin, Meyers, and Labruyere. Meyers should lead and delegate.
 - **Photos for model buildings** will be suggested by Lamberg; **sketches & figures** to be determined by Labruyere with assistance from Hautly. Enslin to update list of what is needed.
 - **Observations:** Hautly stated that standards for additions will be congruent with guidelines by Architectural Review Board. Riggs concerned about flow of information and clarity; after discussion, commission agreed to refer to technical, “city-wide” document as official design guidelines, while referring an end-user to an appendix, “design characteristics,” summary of a specific historic district, with a descriptive list of architectural styles, landmarks and historical overview.
 - **Public hearing process:** Comr. Hautly questioned whether or not the process requires a formal public hearing. Mr. Lamberg will consult with City Attorney. Comr. Hautly motioned to approve for public use design guidelines as drafted, and proceed with public meeting as soon as possible; seconded by Enslin; unanimously approved.
 - **Citizen engagement:** Discussion on appropriate way to submit design guidelines to a citizen committee. Lamberg notified commission that he compiled a list of citizens who positively indicated they are “willing to advise the design guidelines committee.” This list was compiled directly from property owners (who were not originally petitioned) through letters of notice during public hearing process for district designation. Comrs. Riggs & Hautly agreed that all property owners should take note of the proceedings of these public meetings, and at any time they can obtain a draft of design guidelines. Council Liaison Ward stated that the process of publishing

notices of hearings in newspapers is fair for all citizens. Therefore, Mr. Lamberg will not single out any citizen for input, except public notice in the papers.

- **Conformance with existing ordinances.** Comr. Riggs asked if the guidelines conflict with the residential guidelines being developed by the Architectural Review Board. Comr. Hautly stated that former Comr. David Meyers was engaged with the committee and acquired enough working knowledge to avoid discrepancies. Mr. Meyers stated that both sets of guidelines for Landmarks and ARB are congruent in their standards. Furthermore, any guidelines that advise above what is required by ordinance are in accordance to preservation principles, and practically assist the ARB with making determinations in historic districts.
- (2011 FEB) Comr. Enslin sent commissioners a draft of guidelines since last meeting to elicit comments for final revisions. Comr. Labruyere is working on sketches. Comr. Hautly working on introduction, and will present results at March meeting. Mr. Lamberg will check to see where Mr. Meyers is with site work, mechanical guidelines and architectural styles. Comr. Ward will review latest draft and suggest revisions that might streamline document and make it more user friendly. Public Communication Officer von Behren will post what we have on the city's website. This is a work in progress to update existing Design Guidelines and does not constitute ordinance change. As they become available, the commission will publish the guidelines to the website. Mr. Lamberg explained that historic inventory of landmarks and overview of historic districts will cross-reference Design Guidelines.
- (2011 APR) Comr. Riggs requested staff to refer to this project as "Design Guidelines for Kirkwood Landmarks & Historic Districts." Comr. Ward transmitted extensive copy corrections to Mr. Lamberg. Comr. Lab reported progress with more work pending on graphics. Comr. Enslin reported on new copy for architectural styles.
- (2011 MAY) City website contains information available to date.
- (2011 JUN) Making progress per Comr. Enslin & Labruyere, who are comparing notes.
- (2011 JUL) Subcommittee meeting addressed the most important architectural styles, proofreading, photographs.
- (2011 SEP) Comr. Enslin asked Mr. Lamberg to request an update from Mr. Meyers regarding proofreading and photos.

Committee on Architectural Design Guidelines

- (2010 OCT) Residential New Construction for Architectural Review at a Council work session October 14. Mr. Lamberg will convey established procedures for joint review with Landmarks Commission.
- (2011 MAR) Progressing but not complete. Guidelines as complete so far are posted on the City Website. Mayor says that City Council will consider ARB Design review of guidelines in April meetings.
- (2011 APR) Comr. Riggs requested staff to refer to this item as "Committee on Architectural Design Guidelines." Council member Ward reported that it is on the council agenda work session, and if no objections, will move on to Public Hearings.
- (2011 MAY) Some guests voiced concerns that they missed the notice about the town hall meeting, even though it was announced via website, Webster-Kirkwood Times, utility bill, Kmail.

- (2011 SEP) Comr. Enslin asked to clarify if ARB will review permitted building additions, to which Comr. Lewis stated in the affirmative. Mr. Lamberg recommends that one or two commissioners be present at the next ARB meeting in case they need to consult regarding historic districts.

Procedures for Stay of Demolition

(2010 DEC) Commissioners may develop criteria for timelines within the 270 day stay of demolition ordinance in order to establish standards on how much time may be required for different situations.

Kirkwood city website section on historic preservation

(2011 JAN) was implemented with the new layout and needs improvement. Comr. Hautly will work with Mr. Lamberg to convey copy to the city's Public Communication Officer. A shortcut was generated using Google, to make it more accessible to the public at meetings and e-mail signature: <http://goo.gl/a50As>

Planning and Zoning Commission

(2011 APR) had an open meeting on strategic planning, Comr. Riggs was present and reported that the eclectic character and history of Kirkwood were notable strengths. Comr. Riggs and Council Member Ward stated the potential positive effect of citizen consciousness of history and culture. Comr. Riggs considered becoming a citizen liaison between Landmarks Commission and Kirkwood Historical Society.

Building Commission Staff to assist with secretarial duties

(2011 FEB) Mr. Lamberg has approval to begin training the secretaries, Becky Barczewski, Lisa Boedy and TaMara Pelkey to take on some things he's been doing so that he'll have more time to concentrate on responsibilities as Liaison and Cartography. Orientation packet written as a reference for secretaries.

Research on permit fees of other Missouri commissioners

(2011 MAR) It was discussed that this practice does not have favorable results.

Entrance Signs for Newly Designated Historic Districts

(2011 MAY) Mr. Lamberg reported that artwork for North Taylor entrance signs are complete; Architectural Review Board had no further comments. There will be two signs for the N Taylor District-one at the North End and another at the South End.

Candidate commissioners

(2011 MAY) Mr. Lamberg will look at City Clerk's file of volunteer profiles. Council needs to appoint a 3 yr commissioner and revise Comr. Labruyere's term from a 1 yr to a 3 yr. Comr. Hautly considered if increase of the local historic inventory necessitates an increase in the size of the commission from seven to nine members.

Criteria for determination of a local historic district

Mr. Lamberg wrote criteria to assist the commission in making a determination of what properties to include in a local historic district. *For more information, see section above on Nomination of North Taylor Historic District.*

Notification of historic status

(2011 SEP) Comr. Labruyere asked how a buyer is notified of historic status. Comr. Brown responded that a seller's disclosure statement will indicate whether it is or is not. They are also

indexed in title searches, but there are doubts whether or not property owners are diligent in reading the reports. Additionally, when a home is bought, the municipal inspectors should be trained to check if it is on the local register, and, if so, distribute a brochure.

Non-conformity of buildings to permitted building plans

(2011 SEP) Responding to complaints by neighbors, Mr. Lamberg asked Comr. Enslin to observe completed construction at 977 N Taylor (case #1011). Comr. Enslin reported that original features on the elevations as submitted to the Building Commissioner were not built. Comr. Lewis stated in order for that to happen, addendums would have to be submitted on file to the building commissioner, because changes impact not just design, but safety. Mr. Lamberg will talk with the Building Commissioner to see where the oversight occurred.

Residential Design Review in Kirkwood Historic Districts

(2011 NOV) Comr. Lewis suggested staff help Architectural Review Board, encourage them during preliminary review to remind applicant about historic district design guidelines. This could help the joint review process. Comrs. Ward and Lewis provided procedures for residential design review, and Mr. Lamberg designed illustrative fact sheets.

Missouri Tax Credit Program for Historic Buildings

(2011 NOV) Mr. Lamberg forwarded an e-mail from Deb Sheals informing the status. According to the Missouri Dept. of Economic Development, from 1998 to present, historic tax credits spurred more than \$6 billion in redevelopment; 20,833 jobs (not counting construction), and 21,646 new or rehabilitated housing units.

Favorite Building Awards

(2011 APR) After considering the available submissions, Comr. Hautly motioned to postpone the event until further notice; seconded by Enslin, unanimously approved. Mr. Lamberg will draft a press release to notify the public, stating that the commission will consider any submissions previously received and through this year.

Reasons and Rationale for of proposed local historic district of North Taylor

E-Mail from Alan Lamberg (2010 OCT):

The City Clerk's office received letters from three property owners, each lodging a grievance over the 10/13 decision to include their home in the North Taylor local historic district. They filed the grievance in accordance with the provisions of Landmarks Ordinance 12 1/2 - 13. The Code reads that review by the council shall occur within thirty-one (31) days of receipt of the appeal. A phone conference between Mr. Lamberg, City Clerk Betty Montano, and City Attorney John Hessel, yielded the following information:

* This appeal is a first for the Landmarks Commission in its 30-year history;

* Any property owner aggrieved by an administrative body (Landmarks Commission) is entitled to a hearing before a judiciary body (the City Council, in this case).

* A hearing by the Council accommodates the property owner, who will submit, in writing, the reasons why they are aggrieved by the Landmarks decision on North Taylor.

* The Landmarks Commission, with staff assistance, must provide, in writing, reasons and rationale supporting the decision, (presumably the decision to include certain homes into the North Taylor Historic District).

* The City Council's action will either (1) affirm the decision of the Landmarks Commission; or (2) override the decision of the Landmarks Commission; or (3) make no action but hear the aggrieved.

Overriding the Commission would set precedent, and open the door to more property owners appealing Landmarks decision. Presumably, if this is regarding inclusion into districts, then that means historic districts in Kirkwood will look like “swiss cheese” as Mr. Lamberg puts it; historic neighborhoods with holes.

Mr. Lamberg suggested that the commission Chair and Vice Chair confer with him about outlining reasons and rationale. Ideas were solicited from commission members and State Historic Preservation Office.

Mr. Lamberg wrote a **report to the City Council**, (2010 OCT):

“Reasons and Rationale for Historic District Inclusion,” including the following topics:

- Executive summary;
- Background on Kirkwood’s policy on historic preservation;
- Initiative for historic district designation;
- Providing sufficient public notice to affected owners;
- Using criteria for determining inclusion;
- Eligibility for listing on the National Register of historic places;
- Regulations that apply to this house and all places in the district;
- Activity exempt from regulation;
- Owners’ use of their property;
- Owners’ maintenance of their property;
- Market value is not adversely affected by preservation programs;
- Inclusion does not cause economic hardship;
- The effect of exclusion from historic district;
- Written testimonials

Public Hearing by City Council (2010 NOV):

- **Public Comment.** Present were Ms. VandeWater and Ms. Edman, who appealed to City Council their grievance regarding the Landmarks Commission decision to include their homes in the North Taylor Historic District. They requested documentation on how the commission designated the district where the area north of Hollywood Lane and Quan Avenue were not originally petitioned by their neighbors. They were also looking for minutes from last two Landmark Commission public meetings which have not been posted on line yet. Comr. Hautly explained how the Commission is enabled by ordinance to survey and designate the district, as determined based on criteria for historic significance and advisement from a historian.
- **Staff report regarding appeal.** On November 8, Staff Liaison Lamberg outlined ways to improve procedures and advised Comr. Riggs, chair, and Comr. Hautly, vice-chair, that the Commission be proactive in helping the City Council in reconciling the grievance of the two

property owners. Comr. Hautly asserted that City Attorney Hessel at the November 3 public hearing iterated that two homes- not two blocks are against inclusion in the district and to keep comments relevant to the two objector's cases, not the blocks. The Commission will be ready to speak to the City Council when it is time for them to openly deliberate this issue. Comr. Hautly suggested that in the meantime we consider proactive solutions.

Having heard the aggrieved property owners, Mr. Lamberg wrote **a report to the chair of the Landmarks Commission**, (2011 NOV):

“Lessons Learned for Improvement of Procedures,” including the following topics:

- Executive summary;
- Background on Kirkwood's policy on historic preservation;
- Initiative for historic district designation;
- Providing sufficient public notice to affected owners;
- Using criteria for determining inclusion;
- Regulations that apply to this house and all places in the district;
- Activity exempt from regulation;
- Market value is not adversely affected by preservation programs;
- Inclusion does not cause economic hardship;
- The effect of exclusion from historic district;
- Solutions.

The appeal of certain property owners regarding the inclusion of their houses in the North Taylor Historic District, the City Council did not reverse the decision of the Landmarks Commission.³ (2011 JAN) This conclusion was reached after considering the certain findings of fact, including:

1. A home that is a contributing resource to the district;
2. Clarification that the appeal of individuals does not apply to all owners in a certain geographic area;
3. Evidence that the exclusion of the contributing resource in question would negatively impact other properties in the historic district;
4. Statement by owner argued that inclusion of home would negatively affect value of property;
5. Statement by commission that inclusion of home would have positive effect on home and neighboring properties in historic district;
6. Statement by commission that the district was designated to maintain quality of life and enhance value of properties based on the common good, to which the council agrees and believes that exclusion of individual properties from the district would negatively impact neighboring properties;
7. The council recognized the difficulty of this issue, but found that the decision by the commission to include the home was based on a studied analysis following a detailed survey of all the properties, and the benefits of a united, cohesive historic district outweigh the objections raised by the property owner.

³ For further information, see Letters to Property Owners. January 21, 2011. *Betty Montañó, Office of City Clerk*, Kirkwood, Missouri.

LOST



Demolition of Landmark
Landmark #79, Brownhurst, c. 1892



Imminent Demolition of Landmark
Landmark #27, Warner House, c. 1884

SAVE THIS PLACE!

Needs a buyer who will restore for residential occupancy
Eligible for tax credits for qualified restoration
Gill House, c. 1858
Landmark #07, contributor to
Jefferson Argonne National & Local Historic District
419 East Argonne Drive



SAVED!



Mid 20th Century



2011 Photo by Kuri Greenbaum

Adaptive Reuse by
Tom & Judy Honigfort, Great Harvest Bread Company

Old Post Office, c. 1910
Landmark #54, contributor to
Downtown Kirkwood National Historic District
125 West Argonne Drive

PART XI: PRESERVATION PLANS, CHANGES OR REVISIONS

Long range plan. (2011 FEB) Comr. Hautly presented a one page outline she created for 2011 Goals for the commission concerning objectives, target audience, key messages, tactics, media relations, ordinance review, etc. Orientation packages, new member selection guidelines and number of members needed to handle future responsibilities were discussed as prudent to review. Comr. Hautly emphasized this commission purposely charged with preservation, and improved design guidelines will be able to focus on relevant standards.

(2011 APR) Comr. Hautly outlined milestones in the plan, where commissioners should form committees to actively develop initiatives. Walking tours need to be researched for best practices, which Comr. Ward would have good design experience. The office has source files of Kirkwood's previous program. Consider updating the Landmarks Booklet with a grant. Mr. Lamberg needs to follow through with graphic design of Sears House Brochure.

(2011 MAY) Comr. Hautly suggested a marketing plan for tourism, education and ways to celebrate preservation Volunteers could help focus on ways to market in the next year.

(2011 NOV)

Mr. Lamberg stressed that Kirkwood needs a robust preservation plan that calls citizens to action, partnering with the Landmarks Commission and other organizations.

Comr. Bivens will talk with Webster-Kirkwood Times about ideas to promote.

Comr. Enslin: a program like "Tree Keepers" for elementary schools. Outreach to the community, to schools, youth groups, community service, boy scouts, and more.

Landmarks Association, Inc. will advise on grassroots organization, gleaning experience from their nomination for North Taylor and promotion of that historic district by its citizens.



WHERE COMMUNITY AND SPIRIT MEET®

This report is produced as a requirement for the Certified Local Government Agreement between the City of Kirkwood and the Missouri Historic Preservation Agency. It describes the activities of the Preservation Commission during the period of October 1, 2010 through September 30, 2011. Information is included regarding the cases reviewed, survey files, National Register nominations, monitoring, landmark designations and general preservation and outreach activities. Further requirements include educational conferences and seminars attended, attendance records, and this annual report submitted for the 2011 budget.

CITY COUNCIL

Arthur J. McDonnell, *Mayor*
Gerry Biedenstein
Timothy E. Griffin, *Deputy Mayor*
Gina Jaksetic
Bob Sears
Paul W. Ward
Iggy Yuan

LANDMARKS COMMISSION

Dave Brown, *Chair*
Matt Bivens
Catherine Enslin, *Vice-Chair*
Darryl Labruyere
Mike Lewis
Judith Franklin Ward

CITY STAFF

Alan Lamberg, *MPA*
Becky Barczewski

Prepared by the Office of the Landmarks Commission, City of Kirkwood

The City of Kirkwood is interested in effective communication for all people. Upon request, this publication can be made available in an alternate format, such as audiotape, by calling (314) 822-5813.